

Policy on Paper Reviews for IEEE Trans. on IE

Basis for review: The current policy of keeping the reviewers anonymous, having two or three reviews per paper, the associate editor making a recommendation based on the reviewers' reports and finally EIC making the call as to the paper's acceptance for publication in IEEE Trans. on IE is a sound, working and fair policy.

Proposed Policy: In order to increase the impact factor and prestige of the transactions, it is desired to have the following additions to the existing policy. They are to require at least three reviewers per paper, publish the names of all the reviewers in each December issue of the Trans. so that the authors, prospective authors and most importantly the reading public know the caliber and status of the IEEE Trans. IE reviewers, and continuous recruitment and updating of the associate editors for emerging topics and areas. The responsibility of these tasks rests with EIC and to those officers and ADCOM members that the EIC may call upon.

Policy on Paper Reviews Dispute for IEEE Trans. on IE

Basis for review: There are times that authors of papers appeal the decision of the reviewers, associate editor's recommendations and EIC's decision. Under such a circumstance, it is desirable to have a policy to apply uniformly to all such disputes. Currently there is no uniform policy and changes from EIC to EIC. It is the feeling of the officers and ADCOM members that a uniform policy that can be institutionalized and publicized so that all prospective authors can gain higher confidence in the review process and a path to redress any grievances that they may have.

Proposed Policy: The disputes can be appealed to EIC and in case other officers or associate editors are approached with the disputes/appeals, they have to be routed to EIC. EIC alone will handle these appeals/disputes.

When there is an appeal, the EIC can take the following path to address the appeal. The EIC can review the appeal and if it falls into one of the following categories and accordingly take the appropriate action:

- (i) Paper review procedure and any handling problem: This may be addressed at the EIC level itself.
- (ii) Basic differences with one reviewer's comments: EIC may request the AE to address this issue and add his comments, if necessary, to the comments and reply the authors.
- (iii) Basic differences with more than one or all reviewers' comments: EIC may ask a fourth review or take respective AE's comments and finalize his remark based on that.
- (iv) A combination of all the categories or something altogether different: The EIC is empowered to resolve the dispute contained in the appeal in a manner that is fair upholding the integrity of the IEEE Trans. on IE.

Policy on EIC authored/coauthored paper for IEEE Trans. on IE

Basis for review: Currently there is no policy for the handling of the EIC authored/coauthored papers for publication consideration in IEEE Trans. on IE. The review committee for IEEE Trans. on IE recommended that a policy be developed for EIC authored/coauthored papers that are submitted for IEEE Trans. on IE for publication consideration. The policy will help to avoid even an appearance of conflict of interest and project a high ethical standard of the IEEE Trans. on IE, its EIC and its associate editors. It was also requested by the ADCOM that such a policy once formulated is publicized for everyone to see.

Proposed Policy: In order to avoid even an appearance of conflict of interest let alone conflict of interest to the EIC, the following policy concerning the review of papers authored or coauthored by EIC and submitted to IEEE Trans. on IE for publication consideration is to be followed.

- (i) The EIC authored or coauthored papers have to be sent to VP, Publications (VPP) of IES.
- (ii) VPP will invite a well-known leader to be special associate editor for these papers. The special associate editor will remain anonymous.
- (iii) The special associate editor will follow the regular policy of the IEEE Trans. on IE to review the papers and is expected to send his/her final report and decision.
- (iv) The special associate editor's decision will be communicated to the authors by the VPP is final and no appeal will be entertained.
- (v) The VPP will report the number of papers handled this way for each calendar year to the Officers' committee in his/her report for their consideration.